
Chapter 10

Process of Consultations

Universal Health Coverage Process and Context

With the aim of incorporating a comprehensive plan for health within the 12th Five-Year Plan, the Planning Commission, under approval by the Prime Minister, constituted a High Level Expert Group (HLEG) on Universal Health Coverage (UHC), which has been assigned the task of reviewing the experience of India's health sector and suggesting a 10-year strategy going forward. The overall charge of the Committee is to develop a framework for Universal Health Coverage, to be progressively implemented over 2010-2020 (Please refer to Annexure I for the membership and terms of reference of the HLEG).

The Public Health Foundation of India (PHFI) has been appointed the Secretariat, by the Planning Commission of India, to provide technical and logistical support to the High Level Expert Group in preparing its report. Six terms of reference (ToRs) have been formulated under the broader framework of Universal Health Coverage, each of which was addressed by the High Level Expert Group and a dedicated team from the PHFI secretariat.

Deliverables

The report has evolved over three phases of iteration:

Phase 1: An initial progress review was presented to the Planning Commission at the end of **January 2011** as a summary of discussions and suggested ways forward to achieve the provision of 'healthcare for all'.

Phase 2: The process of appraisal and consultations continued with interim recommendations developed by the HLEG at the end of **April 2011**.

Phase 3: The final framework on achieving Universal Health Coverage for India was submitted **on the 21st of October, 2011** comprising of final recommendations of the HLEG.

Description of Process

I. Initial meetings

Dates: 5th and 18th October, 2010

5th October - The HLEG came into effect through Notification No. 9(2)/09-H&FW by the Health and Family Welfare Division of the Planning Commission on 5th October 2010, which defined the composition of the HLEG representing health experts, economists, administrators, civil society and private sector perspectives, along with six terms of reference (ToRs). It recognised the Public Health Foundation of India as the Secretariat of the Expert Group.

The terms of reference (ToRs) are as follows:

1. Develop a blue print and investment plan for meeting the human resource requirements to achieve health for all by 2020.
2. Rework the physical and financial norms needed to ensure quality, universal reach and access to healthcare services, particularly in underserved areas and to indicate the relative role of private and public service providers in this context.

3. Suggest critical management reforms in order to improve efficiency, effectiveness and accountability of the health delivery system.
4. Develop guidelines for the constructive participation of communities, locally elected bodies, NGOs, the private for-profit and not-for-profit sector in the delivery of healthcare.
5. Purpose reforms in policies related to the production, import, pricing, distribution and regulation of essential drugs, vaccines and other essential healthcare related items, for enhancing their availability and reducing cost to consumer.
6. Explore the role of health insurance systems that offer universal access to health services with high subsidy for the poor and a scope for building up additional levels of protection on a payment basis.

The Planning Commission of India convened the first meeting of the HLEG on the **18th October 2010**, to acquaint members with the overall mandate and specific terms of reference.

During interactions with the Deputy Chairman, Member (Health) and Member-Secretary of the Planning Commission, the HLEG members stressed that the social determinants of health too needed to be integrated into the framework of UHC, even though they were not listed as a specific ToR. The Deputy Chairman asked the HLEG also to specifically examine the issues related to the governance of hospitals under the Central Government Health Scheme (CGHS) and the role of public-private partnerships in the delivery of health services. The HLEG decided to hold consultations with and receive position papers from organizations representing the civil society, the private sector as well as consult with international organizations like the World Health Organization (WHO) and the World Bank. Recognizing that the Medicos Friends Circle (MFC) had developed some approach papers for UHC, an interaction with the MFC at their upcoming Nagpur conference was proposed. Similarly, interactions with the representatives of CII, FICCI and ASSOCHAM were planned.

The HLEG also recognised that the broad scope of the ToRs made it difficult to come up with anything other than a landscape and a reasonable level of analyses for each ToR by end-January 2011. Issues related to the definition of UHC were discussed, and it was decided that the MFC definition be used as a working definition till the next meeting. It was also decided that sub-groups corresponding to each ToR be created, each supported by a team of PHFI technical staff.

Setting the agenda

The HLEG was divided into ToR specific Sub-Groups, with dedicated PHFI resource teams that would provide technical support. These technical resource persons would be responsible for preparing background papers under the guidance of the Sub-Group members, as well as for providing general research assistance to the HLEG. The six ToRs were further elaborated and priority areas within each ToR delineated. It was also decided to develop a seventh chapter addressing social determinants of health, as this was seen as an important overlapping element to be covered by, and beyond, all ToRs.

To supplement discussion and discourse, external experts as well as representatives of the Government, civil society and the private sector were to be invited to share information and provide perspectives to the HLEG and inform the work of the Secretariat.

Website

To initiate discussion, facilitate dialogue, share numerous resources/papers, and debate various issues among HLEG members, a secure website was set up at <http://www.hlegphfi.org/>

Developing strategy and approach - Subsequent meetings/consultations of the HLEG

Date: 8th November, 2010

On 8th November, a teleconference was organised during which the HLEG members discussed and debated the definition of UHC to be used by the group. Various issues with respect to the definition were clarified, and it was decided that the planned changes be incorporated and shared with HLEG members for discussion at the next meeting. The 'Preamble', developed by an HLEG member, was shared and discussed during this teleconference, and the need for further refinement of this was recognised.

Note: Dr. G. N. Rao, due to personal reasons, recused himself from the Committee.

Dates: 24th to 26th November, 2010

Venue: PHFI, ISID Campus, New Delhi

The first 3-day meeting of the HLEG and PHFI technical teams was organised from 24th-26th November 2010 in New Delhi. The first half of the first day was devoted to further refining the definition of UHC and the principles on which UHC in India would be based. The modified definition from the previous discussion was further refined and finalised as the working definition for the HLEG. Each of the principles was then discussed, and several issues were raised, many of which were open-ended, requiring further discussion.

This meeting was followed by ToR specific discussions and external presentations by:

- Ms. Archana Joshi from the Deepak Foundation (ToR 4)
- Dr. T. Sundararaman from NHSRC (ToR 1)
- Dr. Dileep Mavalankar from IIMA, (ToR 1)
- Dr. Alok Mukhopadhyay from VHAI (ToR 4)
- Dr. Abhay Shukla from MFC (ToR 4)

The agenda for the next meeting, timeline for report preparation, the structure and format of the report and external presentations to be made over the next 2 months were also discussed.

Dates: 21st to 23rd December, 2010

Venue: PHFI, PHD House, New Delhi

The December meeting was held over the 21st, 22nd and 23rd in New Delhi. The first day consisted of a series of panel discussions on secondary care, tertiary care, human resources and the pharmaceutical industry, with inputs from key stakeholders in these areas from the private sector, government and civil society. The external panel for these sessions included:

- Dr. Naresh Trehan (Chairman and Managing Director Medanta-The Medicity), representing CII (The Confederation of Indian Industry)
- Dr. Devi Shetty (Founder, Narayana Hrudayalaya, Bangalore), representing ASSOCHAM (Associated Chambers of Commerce and Industry of India)
- Dr. V. Renganathan (Co-founder, Vaatsalya Healthcare, Bangalore)
- Mr. Anantkumar (CEO, LifeSpring Hospitals Pvt. Ltd, Hyderabad)
- Ms. Shobana Kamineni (Executive Director, Apollo Hospitals), representing CII/FICCI
- Dr. T. Dileep Kumar (President, Indian Nursing Council)
- Mr. A.B. Kulkarni (Trained Nurses Association of India)
- Mr. S. Srinivasan (Managing Trustee, Low Cost Standard Therapeutics)
- Ms. Leena Mangenay (Lawyer, Médecins Sans Frontières)
- Ms. Kajal Bhardwaj (Lawyer, Independent Consultant-patient groups and patent challenges)

Regrets: Shri. Debashish Panda (Joint Secretary, Ministry of Health & Family Welfare) and Shri. Arun Jha (Joint Secretary, Department of Pharmaceuticals, Government of India).

During the second day, Sub-Group meetings were held during which the HLEG members and the PHFI technical teams evaluated available literature and incorporated inputs from external experts for the development of the ToR-specific background papers. The third day began with a documentary presentation titled 'Sick around the World', followed by summation discussions and plans for the next steps. This included delineation of 5-10 preliminary recommendations over the next 2 weeks.

Dates: 19th to 22nd January, 2011

Venue: PHFI, ISID Campus, New Delhi

During 19-22 January 2011, the HLEG and PHFI secretariat met to write, debrief and consult. At this meeting, a district model for UHC overlapping across all ToRs was discussed in detail. A video conference was organised by the World Bank's China office, where Dr. Jack Langenbrunner, Dr. Shiyong Wang and Dr. Shuo Zhang presented on China's healthcare reforms. In addition, external presentations were made by Dr. Jerry La Forgia and Dr. Somil Nagpal from the World Bank's Delhi office. A background paper was also presented by PHFI research interns on cross-country comparisons. Over the last two days of this meeting, ToR specific priorities were further discussed and refined, and consensus was achieved on many aspects of the impending progress review to be shared with the Planning Commission by the end of January 2011. External presenters included:

- World Bank China presentation - Dr. Jack Langenbrunner (Health Reform in China); Ms. Shiyong Wang (Public Health in China); Dr. Shuo Zhang (Primary Healthcare in China)
- Pragmatic approaches to UHC- (Dr. Jerry La Forgia and Somil Nagpal) from the World Bank's Delhi Office.

II. Additional Consultations

Interactions and discussions with international experts and participation in external meetings have

also been an important part of the HLEG consultation process.

**Dates: 29th November - 9th December, 2010,
13th January, 2011**

Venue: PHFI, ISID Campus, New Delhi

International Experts

Two international experts were invited for consultations and presentations to inform and assist the HLEG.

- Mr. Robert Yates from the UK (Senior Health economist and Senior Social Policy Advisor, DFID,) visited PHFI from 29th November to 9th December 2010. Besides meeting with HLEG members, he gave a presentation on the role of health financing reforms in achieving Universal Health Coverage.
- Dr. Armando di Negri Filho from Brazil (the Head of the Executive Committee of the World Social Forum on Social Security and Health) visited PHFI from 10th to 13th January 2011 and shared with the HLEG and the Secretariat his expertise and perspectives on Brazil's road to Universal Health.

Date: 17th December, 2010,

Venue: McKinsey Office, Gurgaon

Private sector perspectives

Additional consultations were also held with Dr. Mandar Vaidya and Mr. Palash Mitra of McKinsey & Company which resulted in a video conference on the 17th of December with McKinsey's UK based international consultant Dr. Nicolaus Henke. Dr. Henke shared perspectives on health system reform strategies for health coverage adopted in various countries like Egypt, Germany, Belgium, Switzerland, Scandinavia, Latin America and Africa. This included addressing financing mechanisms, levels of care, capacity development, healthcare expenditure and regulation of quality in delivery.

Date: 11th January, 2011

Venue: India Habitat Centre, New Delhi

Lancet-PHFI: Meeting on Healthcare in India

Several HLEG members and the PHFI Secretariat also participated in the Symposium on Healthcare in India which was jointly organized by PHFI and The Lancet, the reputed international medical journal. The Symposium was held on the occasion of a special Lancet series on healthcare in India, developed under the overarching theme of Universal Health Coverage. The articles and commentaries of this series have also been utilized as background papers for the HLEG's work.

III. External meetings and stakeholder participation

Dates: 7th - 9th January, 2011

Venue: CHPH, Gardiner School, Nagpur

Medico Friends Circle Conference on Universal Health Coverage

Members of the HLEG and PHFI Secretariat also attended external meetings being organised within the country. One such meeting was the MFC annual meeting held in Nagpur from 7th to 9th January 2011. The meeting was on Universal Access to Healthcare, and hence was very useful for the HLEG. An internal HLEG meeting was also held at Nagpur, during which various ToR-specific recommendations were discussed.

Date: 15th January, 2011

Venue: Air Link Hotel, Mumbai

A meeting on the 'Regulation of Private Medical Sector for a System of Universal Healthcare' was organised in Mumbai on 15th January 2011, which helped identify and clarify several issues related to private sector regulation. The meeting was attended by 22 participants (including PHFI secretariat members) representing various facets of public/private sectors, NGOs and the civil society.

- Moderators - Dr. Gita Sen, Dr. Yogesh Jain, Dr. Nachiket Mor (HLEG) and Dr. Abhay Shukla (SATHI)

Some of the participants included:

- Dr. Jaya Sagade, ILS Law College, Pune
- Dr. Krishna Kumar, Seven Hills Hospital, Mumbai
- Dr. Anant Phadhke, SATHI, Pune
- Dr. Abhijit More, SATHI, Pune
- Dr. Amita Pitre, Independent Consultant, Mumbai
- Dr. Kamayani, JSA, Mumbai
- Dr. Leni Chaudhuri, JSA, Mumbai
- Dr. Bharat Randive, FRCH, Pune
- Dr. Sarika Chaturvedi, Associate, Foundation for Research in Community Health, Pune
- Dr. Padma Bhate-Deosthahi, Coordinator, CEHAT, Mumbai
- Dr. Vinay Kulkarni, Coordinator Prayas Health Group, Amrita Clinic, Karve
- Dr. Subhash Salunke, PHFI, New Delhi/Nagpur
- Dr. Armida Fernandez, Mumbai
- Dr. Amar Jesani, Indian Journal of Medical Ethics; Trustee, Anusandhan Trust
- Dr. Ravi Duggal, Program Officer, International Budget Partnership; CEHAT, Mumbai
- Dr. Priya Balasubramaniam, PHFI, New Delhi
- Dr. Raj Panda, PHFI, New Delhi
- Dr. Kabir Sheikh, PHFI, New Delhi

IV. ToR-specific meetings

In addition, numerous sub-group related ToR-specific meetings were also held in November, December and January. Some of those include:

Date: 16th November, 2010

Venue: PHFI Campus, New Delhi

A meeting on physical and financial norms for the second term of reference was convened by Shri. Amarjeet Sinha, where a block costing exercise was planned with the HLEG and PHFI secretariat. External experts included:

- Mr. Sunil Nandaraj (National Professional Officer (Health Systems Development), WHO)
- Mr. Gautam Chakravarthy

Date: 8th December, 2010

Venue: NIPFP, New Delhi

HLEG member Prof. Govinda Rao hosted a one-day workshop on current trends in India's Health Insurance Schemes. Speakers included:

- Ms. Sumita Chopra, World Bank
- Mr. Arman Oza, Vimo SEWA Cooperative
- Mr. P.C. Tripathy, Star Health and Allied Insurance Co. Ltd.
- Mr. Sanjay Datta and Vijay Thakur, ICICI Lombard
- Mr. B. Krishnamurthy, United India Insurance Company Ltd.
- Dr. Shibam Ganju, Ingalls Hospital, Harvey, Illinois, USA

Date: 14th January, 2011

Venue: PHFI Campus, New Delhi

A meeting on management reforms was convened by Dr. Gita Sen with Dr. Ravi Duggal presenting.

V. International Expert Conclave

Dates: 14th - 15th February, 2011

Venue: PHFI ISID Campus, New Delhi

The aim of the two-day panel discussion was to understand and learn from the experiences of countries who have tried to provide Universal Health Coverage. The main theme for these international discussions was: 'Mapping the road to Universal Health Coverage- What needs to be done and how'

International participants included:

- Prof. Anne Mills, LSHTM, London
- Dr. Andre-Jacques Neusy, Founder/Director, Center for Global Health (Training for Equity)
- Prof. Timothy Evans, Dean, BRAC School of Public Health, Bangladesh
- Dr. Peter Berman, World Bank, Washington
- Dr. Ravindra P. Rannan-Eliya, IHP, Sri Lanka
- Dr. Robert Hecht, Results for Development Institute
- Dr. Jerry LaForgia, The World Bank
- Mr. Robert Yates, DFID, UK
- Mr. Billy Stewart, Senior Health and AIDS Advisor

National Participants:

- Mr. Devadasan, Institute of Public Health, India
- Mr. Anand Grover, Legal Advisor, Lawyers Collective
- Mr. Abhay Shukla, SATHI-CEHAT
- Prof. V.R. Muraleedharan, IIT, Madras
- Dr. Padmanaban, Advisor (Public Health Administration), National Health Systems Resource Centre, National Rural Health Mission, Ministry of Health and Family Welfare
- Dr. Ravi Duggal, Program Officer, International Budget Partnership
- Prof. Y. V. Reddy, IAS officer, Former Governor, Reserve Bank of India

- Ms. Poonam Muttreja, Director, Population Foundation of India (Secretariat of the AGCA)
- Dr. Dileep Mavalankar, Dean (Academics), Indian Institute of Public Health Gandhinagar
- Dr. T. Sundararaman, Executive Director, NHSRC
- Dr. Sukumar Vellakkal, Health Economist & Adj. Assistant Professor, South Asia Network for Chronic Disease
- Dr. Rajni Ved, Advisor, Community Process, NHSRC

On day one, the panel was divided into several sections, each dedicated to a particular Term of Reference (ToR) where evidence and evolving recommendations were presented. This was followed by discussions, amongst the various attendees who shared their expertise and experiences. The day concluded with an in-depth discussion on the 'Politics of UHC' where the interaction resulted in emphasizing the key need for a political strategy to ensure that UHC is achieved.

On day two of the conclave, the main aim was to create convergence between different ToRs. Three break away groups (ToR 6 & 5, ToR 1 & 4, and ToR 2 & 3) worked towards resolving and consolidating multiple issues of inter-sectoral convergence across their various thematic areas. Later on, each group presented the key points from their discussions, followed by a larger discussion and debate resolving on possible gaps. Dr. Reddy concluded the 2 day panel summarizing key points and next steps based on the panel's collective inputs and suggestions.

VI. Presentation of Progress Review

Dates: 25th February, 2011

Venue: Planning Commission of India, Yojana Bhavan

On the 25th of February, the HLEG was invited to present an initial progress review of the report. A presentation was made by the HLEG chair, Dr. K. Srinath Reddy which summarized the process of consultations, and

emerging points of discussion along with emerging recommendations across the various terms of reference. Suggestions were taken from Planning Commission members who attended, which would be incorporated in the next draft of the report. The Deputy Chairman, Planning Commission also suggested that, as there was a need to examine various issues of health insurance in the country comprehensively, a half day meeting involving various stakeholders would be required, which was subsequently planned.

VII. HLEG Consultations

Dates: 19th March, 2011,

Venue: PHFI ISID Campus, New Delhi

Meeting/Tele-conference: Dr. Vijay Kumar Sankaran (IAS. Spl. Secretary to Government of Tamil Nadu, Dept. of Health and Family Welfare, Chennai) and Mr. Babu (Head-Rajiv Arogyasri Scheme).

This meeting primarily focused on better understanding publicly funded insurance schemes. Also discussed were:

- Public expenditure on health
- Strengthening Primary Care
- Universal entitlement packages
- Merits/Demerits of 'User Fees' as a revenue generating mechanism

Key inputs were given by Dr. Vijaykumar Sankaran on Kalaingar scheme of Tamil Nadu, while the experience from Andhra Pradesh on the Rajiv Arogyasri Scheme was shared through telephonic conversation by Mr. Babu Ahmed (CEO, Arogyasi).

HLEG member attendees:

- Prof. Govinda Rao
- Dr. A.K. Shiva Kumar
- Dr. Nachiket Mor

HLEG Meeting-Constituting a National Health Package

Dates: 22nd -25th March, 2011

Venue: PHFI ISID Campus, New Delhi

This four-day meeting aimed at finalizing essential entitlement packages and infrastructural norms along with the human resources and financing mechanisms required to deliver these essential packages. Other key topics discussed included - gender and vulnerable groups and how to address their specific needs in the UHC architecture along with regulatory systems and accountability across all ToRs. At the end of the 4 days, key recommendations across all the ToRs were identified and refined.

PHFI Secretariat Writing Retreat

Dates: 4th - 6th April, 2011

Venue: Zorba the Buddha, MG Road, Delhi

A writing retreat was organized for the PHFI secretariat. The goal of this three-day retreat was to write up the recommendations based on the inputs from past HLEG meetings and deliberations. The retreat resulted in recommendations and background papers for each ToR, ready to be presented at the next HLEG meeting for discussion.

HLEG Meeting-Structuring Final Report

Dates: 21st -23rd April, 2011

Venue: PHFI ISID Campus, New Delhi

The Agenda of this meeting was to finalize the structure of the final report, starting with identification of the top recommendations from each Term of Reference (ToR), while ensuring linkages across all ToRs. The architecture, narrative and layout of the report were also finalized. The HLEG deliberated on, and arrived at consensus on the chapters on Social Determinants of Health, Gender and Urban Health.

Dates: 12th-14th May, 2011

Venue: PHFI ISID Campus, New Delhi

Final recommendations of each ToR were discussed and revised. Issues across the ToRs were resolved. Discussion on Gender and Health also featured in this meeting.

VIII. Presentations at the Planning Commission

Health Financing Finance Sub-Committee (HLEG Members) Meet at Planning Commission

Dates: 18th May, 2011

Venue: Planning Commission, Yojana Bhavan, New Delhi

On the 30th of March, the Finance Sub-Committee members of the HLEG were invited to share their views at a meeting on Health Insurance convened by the Planning Commission. The focus of the meeting was a discussion on Health Insurance in India. Dr. Nachiket Mor, HLEG member, elaborated on key issues in health financing that the HLEG were deliberating on. This included public spending on health; provision of universal primary healthcare; out of pocket expenditures; and catastrophic illness expenditure.

The meeting also had presentations by Shri Anil Swaroop on RSBY, Dr. Vijay Kumar on the Kalgainar Insurance Scheme, and a presentation on Mukhyamantri Health Insurance Scheme in Rajasthan. **(Note: Dr. Vijay Kumar and the representative form Rajasthan submitted their presentations for discussion as they could not attend the meeting).** The presentations focussed on an overview of the rationale and implementation of the schemes with a focus on costs and breakdowns (including payments to insurance companies for their services), usage patterns of services, claims ratios, and financial sustainability.

This was subsequently followed by a panel discussion with invited international experts, moderated by HLEG Chairperson Dr. K. Srinath Reddy, on 'How the plan for Health Financing in India can be informed by Global experiences?' Key points of the discussion included:

- What are some of the preferred health financing options the HLEG could pursue for UHC and those which have to be avoided, based on international perspectives and lessons learnt from other countries?
- Risk Analysis - health insurance agents versus direct contracting-in of private providers.
- The question of user fees - what works, what does not and why? What can we learn from evidence.

The panel participants included: Dr. Jerry Laforgia (World Bank), Mr. Robert Yates (DFID), Dr. Nachiket Mor (HLEG), Professor Govinda Rao (HLEG) and Dr. A.K. Shiva Kumar (HLEG). Additional invitees included Shri L.C. Goyal (Additional Secretary & Director General, CGHS), Ms. Malathi Jaiswal (Third Party Administrator and Director, Meditech), and Mr. Billy Stewart (Senior Health Advisor, DFID).

IX. Presentation of Draft Executive Summary of Pre Final UHC Report

Dates: 21st August, 2011

**Venue: Planning Commission, Yojana Bhavan
New Delhi**

On the 21st of August, HLEG chair, Dr. K. Srinath Reddy was invited to the Planning Commission to present the final draft of the UHC report and the resulting recommendations. During this meeting a pre-final draft of the Executive Summary that detailed the all of recommendations was shared with the Deputy Chairman (Dr. Montek Singh Ahluwalia) and Member Health (Dr. Sayeda Hameed) along with a draft volume of the chapters on Health Financing and Financial Protection and Access to Medicines. Feedback, suggestions and clarifications from the Planning Commission was taken in account for the final report.

Dates: 13th September, 2011

**Venue: Planning Commission, Yojana Bhavan
New Delhi**

On the 13th of September HLEG chair, Dr. K. Srinath Reddy presented 3 final draft volumes of the High Level Expert Groups framework on Universal Health Coverage along with the Executive Summary to the Deputy Chairman and the Member Health at the Chairman's offices. These volumes contained the final recommendations across all chapters and were in the process receiving a final sign-off from the High Level Expert Group. Suggestions were taken on the regional and national dissemination advocacy of the report going forward along with further consultations on the implementation of the recommendations with international and national stakeholders.

X. Final HLEG Meetings

HLEG Meetings

Dates: 20th July, 2011

Venue: PHFI ISID Campus, New Delhi

This meeting was convened for the HLEG to sign off on the 'Key Recommendations' of the Report. All the recommendations were discussed and any issues were clarified. At the end of this meeting, the Secretariat was given the task of incorporating the changes and consolidating the final report.

Dates: 24th September, 2011

Venue: PHFI ISID Campus, New Delhi

The last HLEG meeting before the submission of the final report on Universal Health Coverage for India was held on the 24th of September 2011. During this meeting the members went through the recommendations, evidence and framework across all chapters and delivered their final sign-off on the report. This

was followed by an informal interaction with select members of the press corps who were invited to a post lunch briefing. Also strategized in detail during this meeting were key next steps on advocacy, endorsement and dissemination of the final UHC report, especially at the state level, by the various members. Plans were charted for regional meetings to discuss and pilot

key recommendations, promoting the report through local media for response and discussion and organise national and state level forums to debate and architect the implementation of key sections of the Universal Health Coverage framework with both regional and national experts

ANNEXURE I

9(2)/09-H&FW Planning Commission
Health & Family Welfare Division

Dated: 5th October, 2010

NOTIFICATION

Subject: High Level Expert Group on Universal Health Coverage

Recognizing the importance of defining a comprehensive strategy for health for the Twelfth Plan, it has been decided with the approval of the Prime Minister to set up a High Level Expert Group on Universal Health Coverage. The Expert Group will have the following composition:

Chairman

Dr K. Srinath Reddy, *President, Public Health Foundation of India*

Members

1	Dr. Abhay Bang	Society for Education, Action and Research in Community Health (SEARCH), Gadchiroli
2	Dr. A. K. Shiva Kumar	Adviser, UNICEF and Member National Advisory Council
3	Sh. Amarjeet Sinha	Principal Secretary, Health & Family Welfare Department (H&FW), Government of Bihar
4	Ms. Anu Garg	Principal Secretary-cum-Commissioner (H&FW), Govt. of Odisha
5	Dr. Gita Sen	Professor, Centre for Public Policy, IIM, Bangalore
6	Dr. G. N. Rao	Distinguished Chair of Eye Health, L V Prasad Eye Institute, Hyderabad (Recused due to personal reasons)
7	Ms. Jashodhra Dasgupta	Coordinator, SAHYOG, Lucknow
8	Dr. Leila Caleb Varkey	Public Health Researcher
9	Prof. M. Govinda Rao	Director, National Institute of Public Finance & Policy
10	Ms. Mirai Chatterjee	Director, Social Security, Self Employed Women's Association (SEWA)
11	Ms. Nachiket Mor	Chairman, Sughavazhvu Healthcare
12	Dr. Vinod Paul	Head of Department, Paediatrics, AIIMS
13	Dr. Yogesh Jain	Jan Swasthya Sahyog, Bilaspur
14	Mr. P. K. Pradhan Representative of MoH&FW	Mission Director (NRHM)
15	Prof. N. K. Sethi	Sr. Adviser (H&FW), Planning Commission - Convener

Terms of Reference

- a). Develop a blue print and investment plan for meeting the human resource requirements to achieve health for all by 2020.
- b) Rework the physical and financial norms needed to ensure quality, universal reach and access of healthcare services, particularly in under-served areas and to indicate the relative role of private and public service providers in this context.
- c) Suggest critical management reforms in order to improve efficiency, effectiveness and accountability of the health delivery system.
- d) Develop guidelines for the constructive participation of communities, local elected bodies, NGOs, the private or-profit and not-for-profit sector in the delivery of healthcare.
- e) Purpose reforms in policies related to the production, import, pricing, distribution and regulation of essential drugs, vaccines and other essential healthcare related items, for enhancing their availability and reducing cost to consumer.
- f) Explore the role of health insurance system that offers universal access to health services with high subsidy for the poor and a scope for building up additional levels of protection on a payment basis

Process of Consultations

The Secretariat of the Expert Group would be located at the Public Health Foundation of India with Financial and Administrative support to be provided by the Planning Commission. TA/DA as admissible to the non-official Members would also be borne by the Planning Commission. However, TA/DA in respect of official Members will be borne by their parent organizations.

The Expert Group will submit its first draft report within four months and the final report within eight months.

(S M MAHAJAN) Adviser (Health)
Tel/Fax 23096709
Email: smmahajan@nic.in

To,

The Chairman & all Members

of the High Level Expert Group on Universal Health Coverage

Copy to:

1. PS to Deputy Chairman/MOS (Planning)/Members (BKC)/(SC)/(SH)/(NJ)/(AS)/(MS)/(KK)/(AM)/ Member-Secretary, Planning Commission, Yojana Bhawan, New Delhi
2. All Pr. Advisers/Advisers/HODs in Planning Commission
3. Prime Minister's Office, South Block, New Delhi
4. Cabinet Secretariat, Rashtrapati Bhawan, New Delhi
5. US (Admn I)/Pay & Accounts Officer/Accounts I Section, Planning Commission/DDO, Planning Commission
6. Information Officer, Planning Commission

(S M MAHAJAN)
Adviser (Health)

Expert Consultants*

The PHFI Secretariat acknowledges and is grateful to the following national and international experts who were consulted for their technical expertise and inputs in the preparation of this report.

National Experts

- Babu Ahmed, Rajiv Arogyasri Scheme
- Kajal Bhardwaj, Independent Consultant
- Sarika Chaturvedi, Foundation for Research in Community Health
- Leni Chaudhuri, Jan Swasthya Abhiyan
- Mita Choudhury, National Institute of Public Finance & Policy
- Sumita Chopra, World Bank
- Sanjay Datta, ICICI Lombard
- Padma Deosthali, Centre for Enquiry Into Health and Allied Themes
- N. Devadasan, Institute of Public Health
- Ravi Duggal, International Budget Partnership, Centre for Enquiry Into Health and Allied Themes
- Armida Fernandez, Sneha Urban Health Centre
- Narendra Gupta, Prayas
- Malathi Jaiswal, Meditech
- Amar Jesani, Indian Journal of Medical Ethics, Anusandhan Trust
- Archana Joshi, Deepak Foundation
- Shobana Kamineni, Apollo Hospitals, representing Confederation of Indian Industry /Federation of Indian Chambers of Commerce and Industry
- Sunil Kaul, The Action Northeast Trust
- B. Krishnamurthy, United India Insurance
- A.B. Kulkarni, Trained Nurses Association of India
- Vinay Kulkarni, Prayas Health Group, Amrita Clinic
- Anant Kumar, LifeSpring Hospitals Pvt. Ltd
- Vijay Kumar, Former Director, Tamil Nadu Health Systems Project
- Krishna Kumar, Seven Hills Hospital
- T. Dileep Kumar, Indian Nursing Council
- Kamayani Bali Mahabal, Jan Swasthya Abhiyan
- Dileep Mavalankar, Indian Institute of Management
- Leena Menghaney, Medicines Sans Frontières
- Nergesh Mistry, Foundation for Research in Community Health
- Abhijit More, Support for Advocacy and Training to Health Initiatives
- Alok Mukhopadhyay, Voluntary Health Association of India
- V.R. Muraleedharan, Indian Institute of Technology, Chennai
- Poonam Muttreja, Population Foundation of India
- Sunil Nandraj, World Health Organisation
- Arman Oza, Vimo Self-Employed Women's Association Cooperative
- P. Padmanaban, National Health Systems Resource Centre
- Anant Phadhke, Support for Advocacy and Training to Health Initiatives
- Amita Pitre, Independent Consultant

***All lists are alphabetized by last name.*

- Bharat Randive, Foundation for Research in Community Health
- Y. Venugopal Reddy, Former Governor, Reserve Bank of India
- V. Renganathan, Co-founder Vaatsalya Healthcare
- Jaya Sagade, Indian Law Society
- Victoria Saint, Foundation for Research in Community Health
- Subhash Salunke, Health Support System Unit, Public Health Foundation of India
- Vijay Kumar Sankaran, Tamil Nadu Department of Health and Family Welfare
- Jay K. Satia, Indian Institute of Public Health-Gandhinagar
- Devi Shetty, Narayana Hrudayalaya, representing Associated Chambers of Commerce and Industry of India
- Abhay Shukla, Support for Advocacy and Training to Health Initiatives, Centre for Enquiry Into Health and Allied Themes
- Sarabjot Singh, Marsh India Insurance Brokers
- S. Srinivasan, Low Cost Standard Therapeutics
- H. Sudarshan, Karuna Trust
- T. Sundararaman, National Health Systems Resource Centre
- P. Suranjeen, Child in Need Institute
- Anil Swaroop, Ministry of Labour
- Vijay Thakur, ICICI Lombard
- Naresh Trehan, Medanta –The Medicity, representing The Confederation of Indian Industry
- P.C. Tripathy, Star Health and Allied Insurance Co. Ltd.
- Prasanta Tripathy, Ekjut
- Rajni Ved, National Health Systems Resource Centre
- Sukumar Vellakal, South Asia Network for Chronic Disease

International Experts

- Peter Berman, World Bank
- Richard Cash, Harvard University
- Lincoln C. Chen, China Medical Board of Cambridge, ME
- Timothy Evans, BRAC School of Public Health
- Jerry La Forgia, World Bank
- Shiban Ganju, Ingalls Hospital, Harvey, Illinois
- Charu C. Garg, World Health Organisation
- Asha George, Johns Hopkins Bloomberg School of Public Health
- Monica Das Gupta, World Bank
- Robert Hecht, Results for Development Institute
- Nicolaus Henke, McKinsey & Company
- Henri van den Hombergh, United Nations Children's Fund
- Karin Hulshof, United Nations Children's Fund
- Joseph Kutzin, World Health Organisation
- Jack Langenbrunner, World Bank
- Marty Makinen, Results for Development Institute
- Nata Menabde, World Health Organisation
- Anne Mills, London School of Hygiene & Tropical Medicine
- Palash Mitra, McKinsey and Company
- Pavitra Mohan, United Nations Children's Fund
- Patrick Mullen, World Bank
- Somil Nagpal, World Bank
- Armando di Negri Filho, World Social Forum on Social Security and Health
- Andre-Jacques Neusy, Center for Global Health (Training for Equity)
- Ravindra P. Rannan-Eliya, Institute for Health Policy
- Jon Rohde
- Stephanie Sealy, Results for Development Institute

- Billy Stewart, Department for International Development
- Mandar Vaidya, McKinsey & Company
- Shiyong Wang, World Bank
- Robert Yates, Department for International Development
- Shuo Zhang, World Bank

Ministry of Health and Family Welfare and Planning Commission of India

- K. Chandramouli, Ministry of Health and Family Welfare
- Keshav Desiraju, Ministry of Health and Family Welfare
- L.K. Goyal, Central Government Health Scheme
- Amit Mohan Prasad, Ministry of Health and Family Welfare
- Sujata Rao, (formerly) Ministry of Health and Family Welfare (participated in key meetings)
- Abhijit Sen, Planning Commission of India
- Amandeep Singh, Planning Commission of India

Funders

The PHFI Secretariat acknowledges and is grateful to the following organisations for their generous support of the activities of the High Level Expert Group and the PHFI Secretariat in the compilation of this report.

- The Planning Commission of India
- The Rockefeller Foundation
- The Department for International Development (DFID)

PHFI Secretariat Team*

The Public Health Foundation of India (PHFI) was the appointed Secretariat, mandated by the Planning Commission of India to provide technical and logistical support to the High Level Expert Group (HLEG) on Universal Health Coverage in preparing this report.

K. Srinath Reddy – President, PHFI

1. Priya Balasubramaniam (Study Director -UHC)
2. Sachin Bhokare
3. Priya Chitkara
4. Maulik Chokshi
5. Thammarao Damiseti (Senior Advisor UHC -Lead, Human Resource for Health)
6. Subhojit Dey
7. Yogeshwar Gupta
8. Habib Hassan
9. Kanav Kahol
10. Shivangini Kar
11. Manjot Kaur
12. Preeti Kumar
13. Shivani Mathur
14. Subhadra Menon
15. Ruchi Mishra
16. Nirmala Mishra
17. Devaki Nambiar (Lead, Social Determinants of Health)
18. Kavitha Narayan (Lead, Health Service Norms)

19. Raj Panda
20. Garima Pathak (Lead, Management & Institutional Reforms)
21. Divya Prakash
22. Sudha Ramani
23. Geetha Ramesh
24. Krishna D. Rao
25. Prasanna Saligram
26. Subhash Salunke
27. Ambika Satija
28. Tarun Seem
29. Shaktivel Selvaraj (Lead, Access to Medicines, Vaccines & Technology/ Health Financing & Financial Protection)
30. Manasi Sharma (Co-Lead, Gender and Health)
31. Kabir Sheikh (Lead, Community Participation & Citizen Engagement)
32. Namrata Verma

Project Consultants*

1. Rakhil Gaitonde, SOCHARA (Community Participation)
2. Navneet Jain, Independent Consultant (Human Resources for Health, Physical & Financial Norms)
3. Renu Khanna, SAHAJ (Gender and Health)
4. V R Raman, Independent Consultant (Community Participation, Urban Health)

**All lists are alphabetized by last name.*

Project Interns*

1. Hilary S. Bartlet, Princeton University
2. Katyayni Seth, Harvard University
3. Vikas Yadav, Harvard University

**All lists are alphabetized by last name.*